Wuthering heights' three Chinese translated versions' reception in China: Translation, publication, and dissemination

¹Qingqing Zhang iD, **²Charity Lee** iD, **³Huzaina Abdul Halim** iD

¹Postgraduate Office, Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, Universiti Malaya, MALAYSIA
¹Postgraduate Office, Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

²Department of Asian and European Languages, Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, Universiti Malaya, MALAYSIA
²Department of Asian and European Languages, Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, 50603, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

³Department of Language & Literacy Education, Faculty of Education, Universiti Malaya, MALAYSIA
³Department of Language and Literary Education, Faculty of Education, 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	This study aims to explore the reception of *Wuthering Heights* in China by conducting comparative study on its three Chinese-translated versions, which were published in three periods, to examine how these versions have been translated, published, and disseminated. This study applies historical and archival research methods, close reading methods and comparative methods. The researchers collected the data from the original text of *Wuthering Heights* and its three Chinese-translated versions, relevant monographs, academic papers and information about the three versions. The academic papers were collected from China National Knowledge Infrastructure, the most authoritative database in China for scientific publications. The information of the three versions was obtained from the Chinese online Chaoxing database, which is the most extensive database that provides information on books based on big data. First, the researchers explored the translation journey of *Wuthering Heights* in China and the information of its three representative versions that appeared at different times. Second, the researchers investigated the publication route of the three versions, concentrating on the information of the publishing houses, the formats of the three versions and the reprint edition. Third, the researchers analyzed the dissemination of the three versions in the Chinese literary field, focusing on the library collections, citations and academic circle comments. This paper concludes that the translation and circulation process of the three versions promoted the dissemination of *Wuthering Heights* in China to a great extent. The reasons for the extensive dissemination of

British writer Emily Brontë (1818-1848) wrote *Wuthering Heights* and published it in 1847, which was her masterpiece that established her status in the British literary world. *Wuthering Heights* was an analysis of love. (Phillips, 2007). In 1930, Wu Guangjian (1867-1943) translated and introduced *Wuthering Heights* to China (Zhou&Sun, 2017). Later on, many translators re-translated it. This novel has attracted generations of Chinese readers and researchers, and the number of its Chinese-translated versions is over 100. The past nine decades witnessed its profound research achievements and Chinese-translated versions.

Based on the academic papers on China National Knowledge Infrastructure (hereafter referred to as CNKI), the most authoritative database for scientific publication, the research achievements on *Wuthering Heights* experienced three stages. In the 1980s, researchers focused on introducing its theme and content. In the 1990s, scholars interpreted it from diversified perspectives such as Biological Interpretation, Gothic Tradition, Archetypal Analysis, Etc. From 2000 to 2022, the past two decades witnessed expanded research on it, the textual analysis of the original texts deepened, and the comparative analysis of its different Chinese translated versions boomed, covering the perspectives of translation theory, linguistics, and comparative literature.

Xie (2017) argued that translation plays an essential role in the existence, circulation, acceptance and study of literary classics around the world. Venuti (2008) pointed out that the foreign-language texts we call 'classics' do not merely attract translation but are constantly re-translated as publishers scramble to transform the cultural capital those texts have acquired into economic capital (p.27). The re-translation journey of *Wuthering Heights* in China has been lasting for over ninety years; according to readers' feedback from Dangdang.com, one of China's largest online book-selling platforms, the versions translated by Yang Yi, Fang Ping, and Sun Zhili received great customer book reviews and were among the "5-star" ranking list. Based on the data from CNKI, Chinese researchers prefer to cite the three translators' versions compared with other translators' versions.

Thus, the three versions translated by Yang Yi, Fang Ping and Sun Zhili were representative versions of *Wuthering Heights*, and the research on them

would reflect the dissemination of *Wuthering Heights* in China to a great extent. However, we seldom have access to the research achievement that describes a clear route of their national circulation. The researchers will conduct empirical research to explore the three translators' versions' translation, publication and dissemination in China. The historical and archival research methods, close reading methods and comparative methods will be applied. Williams& Chesterman (2002) argued that data in historical research include documentary material concerning translations and translators, translation reviews, translators' correspondence, paratexts, and bibliographies of translated works (p.91). The data of this study are the original work of *Wuthering Heights*; the three Chinese translated versions translated by Yang Yi, Fang Ping and Sun Zhili, relevant monographs that contained the information of the three versions, journal articles that focused on the comments of the three versions. The data of journal articles were collected from CNKI.

This study will explore the answers to the two research questions: what were the characteristics of the Chinese-translated versions translated by Yang Yi, Fang Ping and Sun Zhili in terms of the paratexts? How were the three versions published and disseminated in the Chinese literary field? Many scholars conducted research related to the three Chinese-translated versions. Based on the data from CNKI, previous research included two categories, one was the interpretation of a single version, and the other was a comparative study between two versions. For instance, Zhou and Sun (2017) studied Yang Yi's version from the perspective of Translator Behavior Criticism and found that she followed the principle of "truth-seeking oriented, utility-attaining foremost" in translation. Peng and Zhang (2016) compared the characteristics of Yang Yi and Sun Zhili's versions from the perspective of Toury's Translational Norms and concluded that the two translators made different translation strategies in light of the norms in their times. Wang (2012) conducted a comparative study on the versions translated by Yang Yi and Fang Ping from the perspective of translation aesthetics. The author concluded that the two translators reflected the aesthetic values of the original text; however, Yang Yi's version was better than Fang Ping's version.

The previous studies not only had similarities but also differences from this study. In a similar aspect, previous studies and this study focused on the comparative study of the three versions' characteristics. In a different aspect, previous studies were mainly textual analyses between the versions and did not focus on the dissemination of the three versions, but this study explores the dissemination of the three versions. Therefore, this study is to investigate the reception of three versions in China by researching their translation, publication and dissemination.

METHOD
This study adopts empirical research and employs historical and archival research methods, close reading and comparative methods. Williams and Chesterman (2002) defined that empirical research explores new data, new information derived from the observation of data and experimental work; it seeks evidence that supports hypotheses (p.59). Williams and Chesterman (2002) summarized that historical and archival research methods explore, analyze, and interpret existing documentaries and other information, such as bibliographies and historical records (p.67). Smith (2016) elaborated the definition of close reading, which refers to activity concerning texts and a type of text itself: a technically informed, fine-grained analysis of some piece of writing.

Data Collection
This research used documents to collect data. This research primarily explored monographs, academic papers and relevant information referring to the library collection and publication of *Wuthering Heights'* Chinese-translated versions from the relevant database. First, the researchers obtained data from *Wuthering Heights*, written by Emily Brontë (1847) and published in 2016 (second print) by World Publishing Corporation. The Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* was translated by Yang Yi and published in 2011 by the Yilin Press. The Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* was translated by Fang Ping and published in 2010 by Shanghai Translation Publishing House (revised edition). The Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* was translated by Sun Zhili and published in 2016 by Shanghai Literature &Arts Publishing House (revised edition). The monograph *A History of the 20th Century Foreign Literary Translation in China* was written by Zha Mingjian and Xie Tianzhen and published by Hubei Education Press in 2007. Second, the researchers obtained the journal articles referring to the research of *Wuthering Heights* from the China National Knowledge Infrastructure and the information about the library collection and publication of *Wuthering Heights'* Chinese-translated versions from the Chinese online Chaoxing database.

Data Analysis and Instruments
The researchers combined close reading and comparative methods with content analysis to analyze the data. The researchers followed the four steps to analyze the data based on the research questions.

First, the researchers adopted a close reading approach in reading the monographs about the translation journey of *Wuthering Heights* and the three versions of *Wuthering Heights*. The objectives are to explore the overview of its translation journey in China and understand the features of the three versions

by comparing the paratexts of the three versions, focusing on making a comparison of the design of the formats and the content of the preface, footnotes, postface, illustrations, Etc. Dubbati and Abudayeh(2018) pointed out that a paratextual approach to translation studies expands the focus from texts only to include external elements related to translators, readers, and publishers.

Second, the researchers explored the information on the publication of the three versions from relevant monographs and the official websites of the publishing houses to investigate the publication route of the three versions, concentrating on analyzing the features of publication of the three versions and comparing the unique strategies that the publishing houses adopted in the promotion.

Third, the researchers searched for information on library collections and citations of the three versions from the Chinese online Chaoxing database. The comparative analysis was based on the visualized image of data from the Chaoxing database.

Fourth, the researchers searched for the book reviews and articles about the comments made on the three versions from the Chinese online database CNKI. The researchers adopted closing reading methods to analyze the articles and chose to analyze the most relevant and highest citation papers to understand the characteristics of the research focus and comments on the three versions.

FINDINGS

The Translation Journey of *Wuthering Heights* in China

Liang and Xu (2018) stated that translation is vital in the dissemination and reception of work in foreign countries. The first Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* appeared in 1930, with the title 狭路冤家 *(Xiá Lù Yuān Jiā)*, which Wu Guangjian translated. In 1942, the Commercial Press published the version translated by Liang Shiqiu with the title 咆哮山庄 *(Páo Xiào Shān Zhuāng)*. Yang Yi was the first translator that translates its title into 呼啸山庄 *(Hū Xiào Shān Zhuāng)*. Shanghai Pingming Publishing House published her version in 1956, and in 1980, the Jiangsu Renmin Publishing House published her revised version. In 1986, Shanghai Translation Publishing House published Fang Ping's version. Several publishing houses republished the two translators' versions, which won many readers in the 1980s and 1990s. In the 1990s, one or two versions re-translated by other translators emerged every year. The following translators committed to the translation of *Wuthering Heights*: Sun Zhili, Shen Dongzi, Huang Shuiqi, Sun Kaixiang, Zhao Qi, Xu Xifa and Liu Wanrun, Liang Hong, Yang Guangci, Song Zhaolin, Xu Xiaowen, Lv Changxun, Liu Bangli, Ma Hui, Yang Jiang Etc. (Zha&Xie, 2007, p.903).

Yang Yi, Fang Ping and Sun Zhili were three prominent translators in China who devoted themselves to the translation and research of *Wuthering Heights*. Based on the data from CNKI, their versions received great popularity and were widely cited compared with other translators. Yang Yi was a famous translator and used to be employed by the Karl Marx University of Leipzig and Nanjing Normal University. Her version first appeared in the 1950s. In 1981, Yang Yi became a member of the Nanjing Federation of Literary and Art Circles and vice president of the Nanjing Cultural Association. Her version won the only translation prize in the First Jinling Literature Prize in 1986. The version published by Yilin Press won the Seventh National Outstanding Award for best-selling books. Her version was the only Chinese version of *Wuthering Heights* collected by The Brontë Parsonage Museum (Yang, 2013, p.5). Fang Ping (1921-2008), an excellent translator, was born and brought up in Shanghai. He did an in-depth study of *Wuthering Heights* and published a series of academic papers to interpret the work profoundly in the 1980s and 1990s. In 1986, his version emerged, which was published by Shanghai Translation Publishing House. Fang Ping also worked as a senior editor and director of the Foreign Literature editorial department in Shanghai Translation Publishing House. Sun Zhili (1942-) had been working as a professor at PLA University of Foreign Language. He was also a director of the Chinese Translators Association and the vice-chairman of the Henan Translators' Association. He published several academic papers and monographs and committed to several national fund projects related to literary translation studies. He re-translated *Wuthering Heights* at the beginning of the 1990s, and in 1992, Beiyue Literature & Art Publishing House published his Chinese-translated version (Zha&Xie, 2007, p.1077).

The Publication Route of the Three Chinese Translated Versions of *Wuthering Heights* in China
The publication of the three Chinese-translated versions reflected the dissemination of *Wuthering Heights* in China. Sapiro (2008) stated that the publisher, the series, the preface, the presentation of the text and its author, and the translation--all these elements contribute to assigning a meaning to the translated text, which must also be considered. The publication route of the three versions can be explored from the following perspectives: the publishing houses, the formats and the reprint edition.

Several publishing houses contributed to the publication of the three translators' versions. Yilin Press is a "Rising Star" in China's foreign literature's translation and publication, which has published many foreign literary works. The "World Literary Classic Series" was its crucial publication project that won great popularity among readers and the foreign literature research circle (Zha&Xie, 2007, p.804). It published Yang Yi's version more

than ten times, and her version belonged to the "World Literary Classic Series" that promoted its dissemination in China. Shanghai Translation Publishing House is the largest comprehensive professional translation press, founded in 1978. It published several series of literary classics. The "Foreign Literary Classics Series" and "Foreign Literature Series in the 20th Century" won the first national "Special Prize for Excellent Foreign Literature Classics" (Zha&Xie, 2007, p.805). *Wuthering Heights* was among the series. Shanghai Literature &Arts Publishing House was established in 1952 and has developed into a comprehensive publishing house that published brilliant literary works and Chinese and foreign contemporary and modern works. It published a series of books that won the Chinese National Book Award, the highest award for books in China, awarded by the National Press and Publication Administration.

According to Genette (1997), in a literary work, the paratexts surround it and extend it to ensure the text's presence in the world (p.1). Genette (1997) presented the publisher's peritext, containing formats, series, the cover and its appendages, the title page and its appendages (p.vii). Alvstad (2012) emphasized that when publishers present their book lists and authors on their website, paratextual framings such as format design, including book covers, heavily influence a book's reception.

The earliest edition of Yang Yi's version appeared in the 1950s, and it is not accessible. This paper chose to analyze the edition published in 2011 by the Yilin Press, a revised edition and republished in 2018 for the 17th time. Mossop (2017) stated that covers conveyed the information of the texts and can also be regarded as freestanding art objects that influence the sales of the books. The primary colour of the cover was light yellow, with an oil painting that reflected an English village, where a gentleman and a lady were taking a stroll hand by hand. The cover contained two quotations: Chinese versions of comments made by modern British novelist William Somerset Maugham on the love described in *Wuthering Heights* and comments made by modern British commentator Arnold Kettle on the theme of *Wuthering Heights*, respectively. The contents contain the Chinese translated versions of the 34 chapters of *Wuthering Heights*, a preface, a character list, a chronology, a postface and 34 footnotes. In the preface, Yang Yi introduced Emily Brontë's life experience and several reviews on *Wuthering Heights* made by western commentators; she analyzed the love between Catherine and Heathcliff and revealed the reasons that led to Heathcliff's tragedy. In the character list, she presented the names and roles of the characters in *Wuthering Heights*. In the chronology, the main plot of *Wuthering Heights* from the year 1757 to 1803 focused on the critical events which guided readers to have a clear mind of the story. In the postface, she explained her experience of translating *Wuthering Heights*, revising her version and the information on the publication

of different versions. There were 34 footnotes in her version, which consists of two parts. The first part appeared in the preface, which explained the quotations. The second part, dispersed in every chapter, provides cultural background information such as plants, animals, and allusions to literary works.

Shanghai Pingming Publishing House first published Yang Yi's version in 1956. In 1980, her version was published by Jiangsu People's Publishing LTD. The printed number was 350 thousand, which were sold out. The Yilin Press republished her version in the following years, which were 1992, 1997, 2001, 2004, 2005, 2006, 2010, 2011, 2012 and 2016 and 2017, Etc. The year 2019 marked the 100 anniversary of Yang Yi's birthday; Yilin Press published a new edition of *Wuthering Heights* with delicate materials. This edition contained 12 wood engravings as illustrations made by illustrator Clare Leighton and the Brontë Parsonage Museum collected this edition.

Shanghai Translation Publishing House published the earliest edition of Fang Ping's version in 1986, and this paper will focus on the revised one, which was published in 2010 and reprinted in 2020 for the 13th time. The colour of the cover was light blue with a wood engraving which reflected the environment of *Wuthering Heights* with a strong wind that created a gloomy atmosphere. The contents consist of the Chinese translated versions of the 34 chapters of *Wuthering Heights*, a long preface covering 37 pages, a chronology, an environmental map of *Wuthering Heights*, 98 footnotes, and a postface. In the preface, Fang Ping made a brief introduction to the publication of *Wuthering Heights* and the comments it received in Britain in the 19th century. He believed it was a talented work and analyzed the eternal charm of *Wuthering Heights* from the following aspects: artistic structure and theme, the love story on the second generation, the turning point of the plot, the hope reflected on the second generation, the two modes of love and a small society reflected in the book. In the chronology, the period from 1757 to 1802 and the main plot of *Wuthering Heights* and the corresponding chapters. In the environmental map, he showed the location of *Wuthering Heights* and Thrushcross Grange and the surrounding environment. There were 50 illustrations in his version, which were wood engravings made by Fritz Eichenbery and divided into two parts. The first part was at the beginning of each chapter, and the second part was in the whole book; each illustration occupied one page. The second part consisted of 14 vivid illustrations with each title, which reflected the significant plot of the work. In the postface, he introduced the edition of the original work and expressed the aspiration to introduce it to Chinese readers. There were 98 footnotes in his version, which consisted of two parts and provided the readers with much information. The first part was in the preface that illustrated the quotations. The second part was in every chapter, which contained the speaker's implication and

psychology, cultural and social background, allusion, interpretation of the work, translation strategies, Etc.

Fang Ping first published his Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* by Shanghai Translation Publishing House in 1986; later, this version enjoyed a wide readership, and its revised editions were published five times. The following years witnessed the republication of his version by Shanghai Translation Publishing House, which included 1988, 1993, 1998, 2001, 2006, 2010, 2013, 2018 and 2020. China Translation Corporation also published Fang Ping's version in 2009.

Sun Zhili' first edition appeared in 1992. He revised his edition thoroughly once he republished it. This paper chose the revised edition, which was published in 2016. The colour of the cover was black and grey, and the front cover presented a picture of *Wuthering Heights*. The back cover presented a brief introduction of Penguin Classics and a paragraph of comments made by modern British novelist William Somerset Maugham on *Wuthering Heights*. The contents involved the Chinese translated versions of the 34 chapters of *Wuthering Heights*, a declaration of publishing Penguin Classics, the preface, 35 footnotes and the translated version of a guide. In publishing Penguin Classics, we know that the publishing house cooperated with Penguin Books to publish classics and excellent Chinese-translated versions. *Wuthering Heights* belonged to Penguin Classics, and this translated version was prominent. Sun Zhili divided the content into two parts. The first part from chapter 1 to chapter 14 and 15 to 34 was the second part. There was a translation version of a guide written by Pauline Nestor, which was the guide of *Wuthering Heights* in the Penguin Classics of original texts. This guide made a brief introduction of Emily Brontë's life experience and critics' comments on *Wuthering Heights*, which was valuable and broadened readers' horizons. Thirty-five footnotes presented quotations from classic works and the social background information. There was a book list of the Penguin Classics in the appendix.

Sun Zhili's Chinese-translated version of *Wuthering Heights* was first published by Beiyue Literature & Art Publishing House in 1992 and then published by Flower City Publishing House in 1998. In the 21st century, Sun Zhili revised his version thoroughly. The following publishing houses published his version: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press (2013), Yilin Press (2014 and 2019), China Astronautic Publishing House (2015), Shanghai Literature &Arts Publishing House (2016), Modern Press Company Limited (2017), and Sichuan Literature &Arts Publishing House in 2019.

The National Circulation of the Three Chinese Translated Versions of *Wuthering Heights* in China

The existence of a literary field in which foreign literary works can circulate in translation is a key element of the 'translation' (in the mathematical sense) of these works (Gouanvic, 2005). The national circulation of the three versions happened in the literary field. Within the academic field, this circulation occurs in specific settings, including conferences, journals, and books (Sapiro, 2018). In this part, a circulation framework will be made to analyze the national circulation, focusing on the library collections, citations, and comments on the three versions in academic journals in China.

Library collections play a significant role in the circulation of literary works; one can measure the dissemination of literary works by the data of library collections. The Chinese online Chaoxing database provides information on the library collections of books in China, until March 2022, the number of libraries that collected Yang Yi's version was nearly 1900, located in 30 provinces. Her version, published by the Yilin Press in 1990, was collected by 768 libraries, the highest compared with her other versions. The number of libraries that collected Fang Ping's version was nearly 1900, located in 27 provinces. Five hundred twenty-six libraries collected his version that the Shanghai Translation Publishing House published in 1993, the highest compared with his other versions. The number of libraries that collected Sun Zhili's version was nearly 700, located in 28 provinces. His version, published by the Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press in 2013, was collected by 161 libraries, the highest compared with his other versions. The library collections of Yang Yi's and Fang Ping's versions were similar. In the light of the data, we can conclude that library collections of the three versions reflected their wide reception and dissemination in China.

The citations of the Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights* appeared in books and papers. Colin and Mark (2022) mentioned that research texts that receive more citations from others symbolize a degree of prominence in a field of study. According to the data from the Chaoxing database, until March 2022, the citation frequency of the three translators' versions in books and articles was 10307, 4067 and 5626, respectively. The number reflected the popularity of the three translators' versions in China. In the light of the data from CNKI, the three translators' versions were highly cited in journal articles and thesis compared with other translators' Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights*, which reflected the popularization of the three versions in the academic circle. The high citations of the three versions played an essential role in promoting their reception and dissemination in China.

Texts, and in particular source texts and translations, but also translator's drafts, paratexts (prefaces, footnotes, blurbs) and metatexts (reviews, academic articles) constitute one of the primary sources of information in translation studies research in general (Saldanha&O'Brien, 2014, p.218). Bourdieu (1996) emphasized that the recognition of a writer can

be achieved by analyzing the literary prize the work awarded, the sales figures of the work or the articles written about them (p.225). This part will concentrate on the analysis of the metatexts that include reviews and academic articles. Based on the data from CNKI, the comments made on the three versions in the academic circle were diverse. Wu (2021) emphasized the importance of studying local scholars' reviews and comments on literary work to understand its reception in a foreign country. This part will analyze the comments on the three versions in academic journals, focusing on highly cited articles.

Wu Mang wrote the earliest book review of Yang Yi's Chinese-translated version. Wu (1995) introduced Yang Yi's life experience and her translation experience of *Wuthering Heights*. The comments made on Yang Yi's version are divided into three types. Firstly, regarding the translator's translation strategies, Zhou and Sun (2017) researched her version from the perspective of Translator Behavior Criticism. Their analysis revealed that her translator behaviour was inclined to be "utility-attaining", which contained high rationality, following the general principle of "truth-seeking oriented, utility-attaining foremost". Secondly, the research on Yang Yi's version of *Wuthering Heights'* canonization in China. Zhang and Tian (2014) analyzed the interaction of Yang Yi's translation of *Wuthering Heights* with the original text and readers from the target language from the perspective of the Polysystem Theory. It concluded that the translation's artistic value and tension were the absolute power that made it an eternal canon. The third part was the comparative study between Yang Yi's and other translators' versions. Xu and Yuan (2013) compared the complex attributives in five Chinese-translated versions of *Wuthering Heights* from the perspective of corpus-based translation studies. The five versions were translated by Wu Guangjian, Liang Shiqiu, Yang Yi, Fang Ping and Sun Zhili diachronically. The study found a diachronic decrease in the number of complex attributives with "de" as the formal marker in the renditions.

Dong Wugang (1998) wrote the earliest book review of Fang Ping's version. He introduced *Wuthering Heights* and concluded four characteristics of Fang Ping's version: adapting the original version's narrative mode and applying mood particles, applying proverbs to make the language more vivid, polishing the dialogues and creatively applying diverse translation skills. The comments made on Fang Ping's version can be divided into three types; first, the exploration of the features of *Wuthering Heights* by citing his version. Rao (2000) analyzed his version and presented its artistic features: originality, the art of language, and the use of the stream of consciousness and symbolism. In addition, the analysis of Fang Ping's translation strategies and the characteristics of his version, Zhang and Peng (2017) analyzed Fang Ping's version from the perspective of thick translation theory and presented the

prominent features of this version, focusing on analyzing the illustrations, the preface and the footnotes in his version. Last is the comparative study on Fang Ping's version with other translators' versions. Wang and Guan (2013) studied faithfulness in literature translation in light of translation Skopos Theory by conducting a comparative study on Fang Ping's version with Xiao Yao's version. Analyzing the two translators' translation purpose, strategies, and language structure reflected their faithfulness to the original text.

Wu Jun wrote the earliest book review about Sun Zhili's version. Wu (1997) explored the narrative style of *Wuthering Heights* and concluded that Sun Zhili's version reflected the narrative features of the original version, and the language was fluent, which reflected the original version's flavour. The comments on Sun Zhili's version on journals consist of three types. First is comparing the film adapted from *Wuthering Heights* and his version. Zhang (2017) compared the film adapted from *Wuthering Heights*, released in 2011, with the original text. Zhang (2017) presented that the film was similar to the original text, not in form but in spirit, the atmosphere created in the film was better than narration, and the film's allusion was profound. Second is the comparative study between Sun Zhili's version with other versions. The perspectives were various, Sun Zhili's version was the latest version of *Wuthering Heights*, so the significance of re-translation aroused researchers' attention, which can be divided into the following two aspects. Sun and Zhang (2018) verified the necessity of re-translating literary masterpieces by conducting a comparative study on three Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights*. It found that re-translation could alleviate the problems, which were wrong meaning selections, rigid translations and confusing grammar relations to contribute to a better-translated version. Peng and Zhang (2016) analyzed Yang Yi's version and Sun Zhili's version from the perspective of "Translation Norms".They compared the features of the two versions and concluded that the two translators followed the translation norms of their times and emphasized the necessity of re-translation.

DISCUSSION

The study of the translation and dissemination of foreign literary classics' representative translated versions would reflect the reception of the original work. The successful dissemination of the three Chinese-translated versions of *Wuthering Heights* in China was the combination of the efforts made by translators, publishing houses and scholars.

First, the translator's experience in literary translations and academic studies promoted the dissemination of his/her version. Yang Yi devoted herself to introducing *Wuthering Heights* to Chinese readers, and in the 1980s, she translated and published several articles written by western commentators on it. Yang Yi used to be employed by the Karl Marx University

of Leipzig, who gave lectures referring to China's Contemporary Literature. She taught Selected Readings in British Literature in Nanjing Normal University from 1960 to 1980. Fang Ping was a famous translator who translated brilliant writers' works and a prominent expert who did profound research on those writers. He developed a rigorous attitude towards literature translation; he pursued excellence in translation and meticulous research of the original text. Sun Zhili went to study at the Australian National University in 1987 and majored in British and American literature. He was dedicated to literary translation and was a prolific translator who translated more than ten foreign literary works.

Second, the translator's reputation in the academic community would enhance the dissemination of the version. Both Yang Yi and Sun Zhili were teachers in famous universities and belonged to translation associations. Academics often act as editors of series. As is the case with publishers, the series editor's symbolic capital is transferred to the authors and books s/he publishes (Sapiro,2018). After 1949, Fang Ping worked as a senior editor and director in Shanghai Translation Publishing House, and he made a significant contribution to revising and supplementing foreign masterpieces. The three translators polished their versions that promoted the dissemination.

Third, the reputation of the publishing house and the efforts it made promoted the dissemination of the versions. A publisher's commercial strength can also be gauged by its ability to obtain national prizes for its authors (Bourdieu, 2008). The prizes that the publisher houses won helped them to enhance their influence and reputation which promoted the dissemination of the versions. Each publishing house also made extraordinary efforts to promote its dissemination, for instance, participating in book fairs, holding academic conferences and cooperating with a foreign organization. Yang (2011) mentioned that Yilin Press participated in the book fair in Beijing in 1980, promoting her version dissemination (p.324). In 1988, Shanghai Translation Publishing House cooperated with Shanghai Normal University to organize the First Symposium on *Jane Eyre* and *Wuthering Heights* in Shanghai Normal University. From the conference review, Shen and Tao (1988) narrated that delegates from over ten universities in China participated in the conference, and most presenters focused on researching *Wuthering Heights*. Thus, this successful conference contributed to the dissemination of *Wuthering Heights* in China. Penguin is one of the few publisher brands that conceivably have a level of loyalty among consumers (Royle&Stockdale, 1999). Shanghai Literature &Arts Publishing House cooperated with Penguin Books to publish classics, and excellent Chinese-translated versions. *Wuthering Heights* belonged to Penguin Classics, which contained an excellent reputation, and its Chinese version, translated by Sun Zhili, was prominent. The

cooperation between the two organizations promoted the dissemination of his version.

Fourth, the unique paratext in each version and the reprint edition of each version reflected its popularity that promoted dissemination. When publishers present their lists, books and authors on websites, advertisements, book covers, forewords, and so forth, these paratextual framings influence reception (Alvstad, 2012). The three versions were different in format design, and each presented unique characteristics that reflected the original works' features. Such as, the abundant footnotes in Fang Ping's version reflected the rich cultural values of the original work. Yi (2018) argued that footnotes in the translated version can offer a fresh look at those versions as well as their contexts. The three translators' versions were republished several times, which reflected the prevalence in China. In reprinting and republishing, the versions became influential and promoted the spread of the original work.

Fifth, the library collections, citations and comments in the academic circle reflected the popularity of the versions. The three versions' high library collections and citations promoted the dissemination in the literary field. Scholars' comments on the three versions can represent the trend of research conducted on *Wuthering Heights* in China. The artistic features of the original work attracted the scholars' attention. The comments made by scholars in academic circles on the three versions of *Wuthering Heights* promoted their dissemination in China.

CONCLUSION

The eternal glamour in *Wuthering Heights* attracted many scholars to devote themselves to researching it. The study on the dissemination of *Wuthering Heights*' three representative versions in China would enhance our understanding of the reception of *Wuthering Heights* in China; we can summarize our findings as follows.

First, translators' literary translation and research experience and their working experience as university professors or editors helped them to gain a reputation in the academic circle, which guaranteed the dissemination of their versions. Second, the distinctive design of the formats of the version reflected the original work's features and the translator's translation strategies that promoted the dissemination. Third, publishing houses such as Yilin Press, Shanghai Translation Publishing House and Shanghai Literature &Arts Publishing House made an outstanding contribution to republishing the Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights*. The three publishing houses' excellent reputation and the prizes they won also built their reputation that promoted the dissemination of the versions. Fourth, the strategies publishing houses made, such as participating in the book fair, organizing the academic conference and cooperating with reputable publishing houses, accelerated the

Qingqing Zhang, Charity Lee, Huzaina Abdul Halim

dissemination of the versions. Fifth, the circulation of the three versions took place in the literary field, where the library collections, the citations in articles and books and scholars' outstanding research achievements and comments on the three versions contributed to promoting dissemination.

This study also tested the necessity of the re-translation of literary classics. The re-translated versions of *Wuthering Heights* disseminated successfully in China accelerated the circulation of the original text to a great extent. The re-translation and dissemination of *Wuthering Heights* had brought fresh air to Chinese literature. *Wuthering Heights'* classic status in British literature and its distinctive charm is the foundation. The prerequisite is Chinese scholars' efforts in translation and research, and the guarantee is Chinese readers' passion for it.

To sum up, this research aims to contribute to the understanding of the factors that affect the reception of a literary work in a foreign country, applying translation, publication, and dissemination as the approaches of investigative analysis to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the work's afterlife on a global scale. Further research on *Wuthering Heights'* Chinese-translated versions can be conducted by utilizing qualitative and quantitative approaches to examine the features and their dissemination.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

REFERENCES

Alvstad, C. (2012). The strategic moves of paratexts: world literature through Swedish eyes. *Translation Studies*, 5(1), 78-94. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2012.628817

Bourdieu, P. (1996). *The rules of art: Genesis and structure of the literary field.* Stanford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (2008). A conservative revolution in publishing. *Translation studies,* 1(2), 123-153. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14781700802113465

Brontë, E. (2016). *Wuthering Heights.* World Publishing Corporation.

Brontë, E. (2011). Hū Xiào Shān Zhuāng [Wuthering Heights] (Y. Yang, Trans.). Yilin. (Original work published 1847)

Brontë, E. (2010). Hū Xiào Shān Zhuāng [Wuthering Heights] (P. Fang, Trans.). Shanghai Translation. (Original work published 1847)

Brontë, E. (2016). Hū Xiào Shān Zhuāng [Wuthering Heights] (Z.L.Sun, Trans.). Shanghai Literature &Arts. (Original work published 1847)

Colin D. McLaren & Mark W. Bruner (2022) Citation network analysis, *International Review of Sport and Exercise Psychology*, *15*(1), 179-198, https://doi.org/10.1080/1750984X.2021.1989705

Dong, W.G. (1998).Fang Ping's translated version of *Wuthering Heights, Foreign Language and Literature Studies,55*(1),38-42.

Dubbati, B., & Abudayeh, H. (2018). The translator as an activist: reframing conflict in the Arabic translation of Sacco's Footnotes in Gaza. *The Translator 24*(2), 147-165. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2017.1382662

Genette, G. (1997). *Paratexts: Thresholds of interpretation (No. 20).* Cambridge University Press.

Gouanvic, J. M. (2005). A Bourdieusian theory of translation, or the coincidence of practical instances: field, 'habitus', capital and 'illusio'. *The Translator,11*(2)147-166. https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2005.10799196

Liang, L.X., & Xu, M. W.(2018). A comparative analysis of the reception of four English versions of Fu Sheng Liu Ji: translation, publication and international circulation. *Translation Review, 101*(1), 7-30. https://doi.org/10.1080/07374836.2018.1475271

Mossop, B. (2017). Judging a translation by its cover. *The Translator*, *24*(1), 1-16. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2017.1287545

Peng, S.Y.,& Zhang, Q.Q. (2016). Characteristics of the two versions of *Wuthering Heights* based on Toury's Translational Norms, *Foreign Language and Literature Research,2*(3),87-95. DOI:10.16651/j.cnki.fllr.2016.0043

Phillips, J. (2007). The two faces of love in *Wuthering Heights*. *Brontë Studies*, *32*(2), 96-105. https://doi.org/10.1179/147489307X182844

Rao, C.X. (2000). A Study on the artistic features of *Wuthering Heights, Journal of Guangdong Polytechnical Normal University,59*(2),18-23.

Royle, J., Cooper, L., & Stockdale, R. (1999). The use of branding by trade publishers: an investigation into marketing the book as a brand name product. *Publishing Research Quarterly, 15*(4), 3-13. 10.1007/s12109-999-0031-1

Saldanha, G., & O'Brien, S. (2014). *Research methodologies in translation studies*. Routledge.

Sapiro, G. (2008). Translation and the field of publishing: a commentary on Pierre Bourdieu's "A conservative revolution in publishing". *Translation Studies*, *1*(2), 154-166. https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700802113473

Sapiro, G. (2018). What factors determine the international circulation of scholarly books? The example of translations between English and French in the era of globalization.In Heilbron, J., Sorá, G., Boncourt, T. (Eds.), The social and human sciences in global power relations (1 ed., pp. 59-93). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

Shen, J.Q,&Tao, Y.(1988).The Conference Review of the First Symposium on *Jane Eyre* and *Wuthering Heights*, *Foreign Literature Studies*,*39*(1),28.

Smith, B. H. (2016). What was "close reading"? A century of method in literary studies. *The Minnesota Review, 2016*(87), 57-75. https://doi.org/10.1215/00265667-3630844

Sun, X.Y., & Zhang, B.H. (2018). Verifying the necessity of re-translating literary masterpieces by three Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights*, *Journal of North China University of Water Resources and Electric Power(Social Science Edition)*,*34*(3), 122-125. DOI: 10. 13790 /j. cnki. issn1008－4444．2018．03．030

Venuti, L. (2008).Translation, interpretation, canon formation. In Lianeri, A. & Zajko, V(Eds.), *Translation and the Classic: Identity as Change in the History of Culture*(1 ed., pp.27-51). Oxford University Press.

Wang, N. (2012). On Chinese translation of *Wuthering Heights* from the perspective of Translation Aesthetics--a comparison of Fang Ping's version and Yang Yi's version [Master's thesis, Guangxi Normal University]. China Master's Theses Full-text Database.

Wang, Z.P.,&Guan, R.F.(2013). Faithfulness in literature translation in light of Translation Skopos Theory--by comparing two Chinese versions of *Wuthering Heights*, *Journal of Jilin Normal University (Humanities & Social Science Edition)*,*41*(5),36-38. DOI: 10.3969/j.issn.1007-5674.2013.05.011

Williams, J., & Chesterman, A. (2002). *The map: a beginner's guide to doing research in translation studies*. Routledge.

Wu, J. (1997). The narrative style of *Wuthering Heights is* embodied in Sun Zhili's Chinese translated version, *Foreign Language Research*,*54*(4),55-56+64. DOI: 10. 13978 /j . cnki . wyyj . 1997. 04. 015

Wu, M. (1995).Yang Yi and *Wuthering Heights*. *A Vast View on Publishing*,*6*(6), 30-32.

Wu, Y. (2021). The Reception of Mo Yan's Novel Thirteen Steps《十三步》） in Spanish speaking Regions from the Perspective of Variation Theory. *Comparative Literature: East & West*, *5*(2), 204-216. https://doi.org/10.1080/25723618.2021.2006427

Xie, T.Z. (2017). Medio-Translatology: New perspectives on Comparative Literature and Translation Studies. *Comparative Literature: East & West*, *1*(1), 125-133.

https://doi.org/10.1080/25723618.2017.1339513

Xu, J., &Yuan, H.(2013).A Diachronical Study on the complex attributives from the perspective of Corpus-based Translation Studies--a case study on five Chinese translations of *Wuthering Heights*, *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching*, *272*(5),65-68.

Yang, Y. (2013). Qīng Qīng Zhě Yì[The golden memories of my youth].Fudan University Press.

Yi, A. T. (2018). When Notes Start to Speak: An Investigation of Footnotes and Interlinear Notes in Contemporary Chinese Bible Versions. *The Bible Translator*, *69*(1), 56-78. https://doi.org/10.1177/2051677018754654

Zha, M.J., & Xie, T.Z. (2007).Zhōng Guó Èr Shí Shì Jì Waì Guó Wén Xué Fān Yì Shǐ[A History of the 20th Century Foreign Literary Translation in China].Hubei Education Press

Zhang, Q.Q,&Peng, S.Y.(2017).A study of Fang Ping's version of *Wuthering Heights* from the perspective of Thick Translation, *English Square(Academic Research),82*(10),3-7. DOI: 10.16723/j.cnki.yygc.2017.10.001

Zhang, Y. H. (2017). The film *Wuthering Heights* produced in 2011, reflected the poetic features of the original text, *Journal of Education and Media Studies*, *11*(5), 88-91. DOI: 10.19400/j.cnki.cn10-1407/g2.2017.05.024

Zhang, Z.Y.,&Tian D.B.(2014).Road to canonized translated literature—Yang Yi's translation of *Wuthering Heights* in China, *Journal of Hefei University of Technology(Social Sciences)*, *138(*5),83-88.

Zhou, L.S., & Sun, X.X. (2017). A study of Yang Yi's version of *Wuthering Heights*: from the perspective of Translator Behavior Criticism, *Foreign Languages and Their Teaching,369*(6),114-122,148-149. DOI: 10.13458/j.cnki.flatt.004449

THE AUTHORS

Qingqing Zhang is currently a PhD candidate in the Faculty of Languages & Linguistics, Universiti Malaya. Her primary research interests lie in translation studies and discourse analysis.

Charity Lee is currently a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Languages & Linguistics, Universiti Malaya. Her main areas of research include narrative analysis and discourse analysis.

Huzaina Abdul Halim is currently a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Education, Universiti Malaya. Her main areas of research include creativity in the ESL curriculum and performance in literature education.